

**IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA**

**AUDRA MCCOWAN, et al.,**

Plaintiffs,

v.

**CITY OF PHILADELPHIA, et al.,**

Defendants.

**CIVIL ACTION**

**NO. 19-3326-KSM**

**ORDER**

AND NOW this 10th day of March, 2022, upon consideration of Defendant Curtis Younger's Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. No. 132), Plaintiffs' opposition brief (Doc. No. 166), the City of Philadelphia and individual City Defendants' Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. No. 133), Plaintiffs' opposition brief (Doc. No. 167), Defendant Richard Ross Jr.'s Motion for Summary Judgment (Doc. No. 136), and Plaintiffs' opposition brief (Doc. No. 168), and following oral argument on February 16, 2022, it is **ORDERED** that the motions (Doc. Nos. 132, 133, 136) are **GRANTED IN PART** and **DENIED IN PART** as follows:

1. Summary judgment is **GRANTED** in favor of Defendants Daniel MacDonald, Michael McCarrick, Timothy McHugh, Kevin O'Brien, Eric Williford, Tamika Allen, and Brent

Conway all of Plaintiff Audra McCowan's claims.

2. Summary judgment is **GRANTED IN PART** and **DENIED IN PART** to Defendants the City of Philadelphia, Richard Ross, Jr., Christine Coulter, and Curtis Younger.

As explained in the accompanying Memorandum, summary judgment is **DENIED** as to the following counts against each identified Defendant:

<b>Count</b>	<b>Claim</b>	<b>Defendant(s)</b>
I	Title VII Disparate Treatment	City of Philadelphia
II	Title VII Hostile Work Environment	City of Philadelphia
III	Title VII Retaliation	City of Philadelphia
XI	Section 1983 Disparate Treatment in Violation of Equal Protection Clause	Coulter
XII	Section 1983 Hostile Work Environment in Violation of Equal Protection Clause	City of Philadelphia, Ross, and Coulter
XIV	Pennsylvania Whistleblower Retaliation	City of Philadelphia and Coulter
XVI	Battery	Younger
XVII	PHRA Discrimination	City of Philadelphia
XVIII	PHRA Retaliation	City of Philadelphia and Coulter
XIX	PHRA Aiding and Abetting	Ross and Coulter
XX	PFPO Discrimination	City of Philadelphia
XXI	PFPO Retaliation	City of Philadelphia and Coulter
XXII	PFPO Aiding and Abetting	Ross and Coulter

As to all other claims asserted by McCowan, summary judgment is **GRANTED** in favor of the City of Philadelphia, Richard Ross, Jr., Christine Coulter, and Curtis Younger.

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

/s/*Karen Spencer Marston*

---

KAREN SPENCER MARSTON, J.